

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: September 19, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 3:30 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Robbie Cangelosi

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the August 22, 2017 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 1507 Magazine St.

Application: Kim Hosch, applicant; Klaus-Peter Schreiber Trust, The KlausPeter Schreiber Trust, owner;

New construction of one story, detached accessory building for existing hotel.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the version with the zinc panels for exterior siding and standing seam metal roof of a darker color. All details to be worked out at the staff level.

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1324 Magazine St.

Application: Megan Bell, applicant; 1335 Magazine LLC, owner; New construction of two adjacent, two-story commercial buildings with landscaped access to a rear courtyard. Total built area 19, 000 sq.ft.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Elliott Perkins made a motion to to defer this application for additional review. ARC agreed that more detailed drawings of the adjacent buildings are needed to adequately review the contextual relationship of the proposed design with its surrounding.

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1818 Magazine St.

Application: Megan Bell, applicant; Thursday Dinner, LLC, owner; Renovation of an existing 4,700 sf two-story commercial building, balcony extension and rear addition are proposed to match historic locations as indicated on prior Sanborn maps.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The changes proposed to the ground floor openings are not appropriate and need further study. The existing solid shutters at the ground floor should remain, and louvered shutters would be appropriate for the second floor. The ARC agreed that the extension of the gallery could be handled at the staff level, but the column spacing should be regularized. The proposed rear addition should have metal panel siding and proportions of the windows should be studied.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In Favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 625 Egan St.

Application: Diana Grove, applicant/owner; Construct a one story 1504 sqft single family dwelling on vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level provided:

- Addition of appropriately sized louvered shutters on the front elevation
- If parking space is on the lot, the building must be designed such that no parking will be between the front wall of the building and the street. 18'-0" minimum parking space on the side of building, measured from the front wall of the building.
- The depth of the porch should be increased to a minimum depth of 6'-0".
- Header heights of all windows and doors or transoms should be consistent throughout.
- If walk-through windows are to be installed on the building, the sill height should be at the level of the front porch decking. Otherwise, windows should be installed with a more typical sill height for the building.
- Window divisions and column design should be altered to match the final design style of the building.
- Roof rafter to wall connection should be refined to be a more historically appropriate condition.

Second: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Robbie Cangelosi arrived to the meeting.

6. 611 Deslonde St.

Application: Lydia Stein, applicant; Love Farm LLC, owner; Camelback addition to existing single story residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level, provided the following:

- Change the orientation of the roof pitch on the camelback addition such that the addition will have side gables as opposed front and rear gables.
- Revise window dimensions and divisions to reflect the original windows in the building. The windows should have vertical proportions and divisions.
- Revise the rafter to wall condition such that there are no overhangs over the side gables of the addition.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 3919 Marais St.

Application: Mark Morice, applicant; Treyark Properties LLC, owner; New construction of two-story residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi and the ARC agreed that the double windows at the street elevation were atypical. A door and single window, with a front porch as shown on the original iteration, would be more successful and could be accomplished by switching the location of the bedroom and bathroom in plan. The door could be fixed or operable. Additionally, the ARC felt that the detailing of the building was referencing different styles, and that the design should be detailed to provide a clear indication of one particular style. For example, if a Craftsman style is desired, the cornices above the windows should be eliminated and other features on the house should also reference that style. They also recommended increasing the pitch of the roof to 7/12.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2524 St Charles Ave.

Application: Andrew Spaulding, applicant; Robert Lynn Priddy, owner; Construct rear porch addition to Significant raised single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposal is too large. The ARC recommended reducing the overall proposal by shifting the porch back one (1) bay past the existing window and associated casing, reducing the depth by one (1) foot, and reducing the dimensions of the columns. They agreed that the stairs could remain in its proposed location, but recommended shifting the accessibility lift inward to the revised location of the porch. The ARC agreed that copper would be an inappropriate roofing material and suggested an alternate metal roofing material, i.e. standing seam.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 4437 Painters St.

Application: Magic Makeover Construction, LLC, applicant; Jacqueline Demagnus, owner; Modifications to rear of Landmark building, including removal of window openings and enclosing small second-story porch. Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with their recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that it was necessary to understand the original condition of the building prior to determining whether or not the proposed changes were appropriate for this Landmark structure. They felt that some modifications to the rear windows and second-story porch may be possible; however, as the second-story addition at the southeast corner of the building would require changes to the original curved roof form, that part of the proposal was not approvable. The staff will review the architect's drawings of the building to determine which elements of the house are original and what modifications can be made while maintaining its historic integrity.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 1519 N Villere

Comments: This item was withdrawn

11. 1013 Jourdan St.

Application: Scarlett Nakajima, applicant; Nakajima Home Leasing LLC, owner; Renovation and camelback addition to existing multi-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level, provided the following:

- Revise the details of the camelback addition to reflect the details of the existing building. Specifically match the existing exposed rafter tail condition on the new addition.
- "Option #4" is the most appropriate option that was presented.

Second: Robbie Cangelosi

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 4011 Dauphine St.

Application: Kristine Shull, applicant; John P Gonzalez, owner; New construction of two-story residential building.

Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that both doors should be single pane-over-panel doors, without the vertical division in the glass. The proportions of the panel also need adjustment, as the panel currently comes up too high.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi

Opposed:

Comments

13. 4015 Dauphine St.
Application: Kristine Shull, applicant; John P Gonzalez, owner; New construction of two-story residential building.
Motion: Robbie Cangelosi made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that both doors should be single pane-over-panel doors, without the vertical division in the glass. The proportions of the panel also need adjustment, as the panel currently comes up too high.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Robbie Cangelosi
Opposed:
Comments:
14. 2212 Esplanade St.
Application: Mason Ros Architecture & Interiors, applicant; Melanie Schmitt, owner; Renovation of existing decks and balcony, construction of two story rear addition and exterior staircase.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend that the Commission not grant conceptual approval to enclose the historic side gallery of this building, as required by the Guidelines. However, the ARC did recommend conceptual approval for the two-story rear screen addition, provided the exterior stair be placed on the interior of the building or within the footprint of the addition, behind the screen.
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed: Robbie Cangelosi
Comments:
14. 2705 N Rampart St.
Application: Courtney Ordone, applicant; Paul G Doyen, owner; Renovate and construct camelback addition on existing shotgun double. Renovation includes the removal of historic brick chimney.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposed windows at the front elevation should be reduced to match the windows of the adjacent 'sister' house. With regard to the camelback, the ARC recommended reducing the roof height, and enlarging and shifting the windows at the front of the camelback to align with the doors at the front facade. The ARC agreed that the first window on the left side elevation should remain in its original location, and the triple window should be broken up into two (2) separate windows to a distance that would allow the installation of operable shutters. Additionally they agreed the last window on the left side elevation should be shifted back closer to the edge of the building.
Second: Robbie Cangelosi
Result: Passed
In favor: Elliott Perkins, John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley
Opposed: Robbie Cangelosi
Comments:
15. 717 Teche St.
Comments: This item was withdrawn.

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.

